

# Lesson 12: The Negotiations of Interviewing

## Category: Job Search Skills

### Employability Skills

- a) Interpersonal Communication
- b) Enthusiasm & Attitude
- c) Problem Solving & Critical Thinking
- d) Flexibility & Adaptability
- e) Ability to Accept and Integrate Criticism and Feedback

### Instructional Direction

This activity is an extension on the employability skills related to interviewing and networking and is based on the case studies in the Program on Negotiation at Harvard Law School. Students work together in small groups to role play an interviewing scenario. One student must play the employer and at least two students play potential candidates. Ideally, the activity is designed for groups of five students. When less than five students are available for a group, the instructor should take note of which candidate profile(s) has/have been excluded as this will affect the possible hiring outcomes.

Choose to have this completed as a panel session with all candidates present at once or as individual interviews in rotation with employer. In either case, students are allowed to work freely without coaching but within specific time parameters. All students should be given at least ten minutes to read their profiles, plan, and make notes. After the individual planning period, the negotiation activity itself should not last more than 15–20 minutes.

Detailed instructions for this activity are included as Blackline Master 12a, which also includes the teacher copy of the individual role play profiles and possible negotiation outcomes.

Blackline Master 12b has the individual student role play profiles and note taking template where they can record their thoughts on their position, interests, and BATNA (concepts which are explained in the detailed instructions and included in the PowerPoint available online at [www.wrksolutions.com/negotiationslides](http://www.wrksolutions.com/negotiationslides)).

### Learning Outcome(s)

Students will be able to critically evaluate a situation and apply labor market information in order to determine when and how to share information to achieve desired results.

### Resources Needed

1. Negotiation Scenario instructions and worksheets (Blackline Master 12a and 12b)
2. Writing utensils
3. PowerPoint, if the instructor would like to provide more detailed instruction on the legalese (especially applicable for CTE instruction in the legal field; but, also valuable for framing a rather complex lesson)

### Modification and Extensions

- Have students create their own profile that they believe will get them hired in this scenario.
- Assign groups to create their own mock scenario and profiles based on an industry and profession in the Workforce Solutions High-Skill, High-Growth guide.



# NEGOTIATION SCENARIO INSTRUCTIONS

This activity is an extension on the employability skills related to interviewing and networking. Students are expected to work together in small groups to role play an interviewing scenario. One student must play the employer and at least two students must play potential candidates. Ideally, the activity is designed for groups of five students. When there are less than five students available for a group, the instructor should take note of which candidate profile(s) has/have been excluded as this will affect the possible hiring outcomes.

You can either choose to have this completed as a panel session with all candidates present at once or as individual interviews in rotation with the employer. In either case, it is recommended that students are allowed to work freely without coaching but within specific time parameters. All students should be given ten minutes to read their profiles, plan, and make notes. After the individual planning period, the negotiation activity itself should not last more than 15–20 minutes.

Prior to beginning the activity, the instructor may choose to cover the following concepts:

1. **Position** – An individual's worth in a specific context. What qualities do you hold that make you or your investment valuable? What qualities do you hold that make you or your investment risky? For the item of negotiation, is the supply greater than the demand or vice versa? How does the supply-demand dynamic affect a negotiation? (answer: it can greatly influence who holds more power initially)  
  
*Example:* Who has a better position in a rock band? The lead singer or the bass guitarist? What is the importance of each to the band? Who is more easily replaced? Who influences the image of the band more? If either left the band in an instant, would the band survive?
2. **Interests** – What are your priorities in a negotiation? What have you got to win or lose? What are the “must have”s, the “it would be nice to have”s, and the “it doesn’t matter to me”s. Organizing your interests helps in planning for the bargaining stage of a negotiation.
3. **BATNA (Best Alternative to a Negotiated Agreement)** – Best option when an ideal outcome cannot be reached. If the other party refuses to continue negotiation or if you reach a standstill, what is your best 2nd option? Having a backup plan gives you perspective when trying to get the best deal possible. Your counterpart may also have an ideal outcome and a BATNA...or they may not. It is up to you to discover positions and interests to determine your power in the negotiation and BATNA.

Students should be reminded that this is a scenario to help their employability by working on skills such as effective communication, prioritization of tasks & goals, following directions, planning, and skills evaluation. Each of the student scenarios is included below:

## Scenario #1: Pipeline Welder

Employer:

- You are hiring a welder and can offer up to \$24/hr for someone with at least one year of experience. You may offer less. One year of experience is preferred but not required.
- Your company benefits include full medical and dental, a retirement plan, a company vehicle for work, and 15 vacation days a year.
- You must hire someone with at least a 2 year welding certificate that has some experience in pipeline welding. No exceptions.
- Your company has had trouble hiring people for evening and overnight shifts. The last three hires have left because they either get offered better hours or cannot balance the schedule with their family obligations.
- If you hire someone for \$16/hr or less, you CAN offer a SECOND person a job for \$16/hr or less, but the 2nd hire must have at least a one-year certificate. You also receive a \$5000 bonus for hiring two people for less than the price of one.



## Candidate #1

- You are an experienced pipeline welder of five years and have a one-year certificate from Lone Star College. You are looking to make no less than \$18/hr
- You are married with four children, ages 4, 7, 14, and 23 – good employer benefits are important to you.
- Your spouse works as a night nurse's aide and so an evening shift is least desirable. You are looking for new work because your last company has asked you to work nights and it is difficult on your home life.
- You were fired from your first job after college for yelling at a co-worker. You have since not had any discipline or other write-ups at any of your jobs.

## Candidate #2

- You are fresh out of college with a two-year certificate in pipeline welding. You have done an internship at PipeCo Inc. for four months and had good ratings from your mentor.
- You are a single parent of two children ages 9 and 11. Good employer benefits are important to you.
- Your family lives with your parents who take care of your children when you are working. You prefer not to work nights but can accommodate any schedule.
- Your previous work experience is as a pizza delivery driver, a retail sales clerk for a shoe store, and a night janitor for the school district.
- You do not know how much a welder with your experience should make and would be happy with anything over \$10/hr.

## Candidate #3

- You do not have a degree or certificate and learned your welding skills from your uncle. You feel you are fairly talented and can do some pipeline welds. You have worked in your uncle's shop for the past two years and have had zero customer complaints.
- You do not have children but have a serious girlfriend/boyfriend and s/he got you this interview because s/he works for the company in their business office.
- You would like to make at least \$12/hr. Benefits are not important to you but would be nice since they are required for all people and you would rather not pay out of pocket for a plan.
- You prefer to work nights or overnights but do not want to work on weekends.

## Candidate #4

- You have a two-year degree from Houston Community College in Pipeline Welding. You have two years of experience as a Pipeline Welding Tech for Shoreline Company and have just been promoted with a raise to Tech II making \$19/hr. You also get time and a half pay when you work nights and weekends, which you do not mind.
- You are looking for new work because you know the job market needs people like you. Because of this, you will settle for no less than \$23/hr.
- You have been offered a position with Sparx Inc. as a Tech II for \$22/hr.
- You have a spouse and a newborn daughter named Elizabeth. You would like to work closer to home and this company is right around the corner from your house. Your current job is a 30 mile drive round-trip and requires frequent travel. It is putting many miles on your vehicle which is starting to need more maintenance and repair work.
- You have great benefits at your current company with 18 vacation days and full medical and dental.



## POSSIBLE OUTCOMES:

The individual profiles contain parameters that should assist the students in prioritizing in planning. It is inevitable that students will miss details and an “impossible” outcome will be selected. This is an opportunity to allow for review of the profile details to see why this outcome is not possible. Allowing time for the discussion questions that follow are a great way to have students discover the importance of proper research, questioning, and, of course, negotiation skills.

**First, Candidate #3 should never be hired.** This candidate does not have the formal education required and could be a risky hire. Schools will teach to a standard and employers often learn the expected outcomes of schools that produce quality students and future workers. Someone that is self-taught might have great skills but could bolster this experience by holding an industry-recognized credential.

### Viable Option 1:

**Candidate #4 is hired.** S/he is the only candidate that meets the preference of at least one year of experience and the requirement of a two-year certificate. The pay rate should be \$23-24/hr if Candidate #4 adhered to the guidelines of his profile. If Candidate #4 was hired at a lesser rate of pay, kudos to the employer for good negotiation skills! Also, if Candidate #4 agreed to \$16/hr or less,

### Viable Option 2:

**Candidate #2 is hired.** S/he can be the only hire OR if Candidate #2 agreed to a rate of pay \$16/hr or less, **Candidate #1** could also be hired. Candidate #2 has the required two-year certificate but has less than the desired one year of experience. Still, this is only a preference so Candidate #2 is eligible for hire. Also, Candidate #2 has no idea that \$10/hr is a low rate of pay for this position. This can be a point of discussion at the end of the activity by either having the employer read their own profile or by having students “compare notes” on each other’s profiles.

Candidate #1 can only be hired if Candidate #2 is also hired. If Candidate #2 and #1 are hired, they must both make \$16/hr or less. If not, the employer spent too much money on less experienced employees and has just cost the company money. NO BONUS!

## Follow-up Discussion Questions

Before discussion begins, have each of the new hires stand with their new employers and explain what agreement they derived. How much pay will they receive? When will they work? What do they know about their benefits? What else may have been part of the agreement?

1. For the employers, what did you consider most important when looking for a new hire?
2. Same question for new hires.
3. If Candidate #3 was hired, how was this possible since s/he did not meet any of the parameters needed for a new hire?
4. Did any employers or candidates talk about anything other than skill-related information? Families? Past work experience? Other circumstance? If so, did this affect your decision either negatively or positively? If so, how and why?
5. What does this make you think of the employment process? Would this scenario be different if the labor pool had more qualified candidates? What if the job requirements were reduced? Can we think of an example where a job has fewer qualifications and many available candidates? How might this affect wages and benefits?



Name \_\_\_\_\_

Period \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

# NEGOTIATION SCENARIO WORKSHEET

## Scenario #1: Pipeline Welder

### Employer:

- You are hiring a welder and can offer up to \$24/hr for someone with at least one year of experience. You may offer less. One year of experience is preferred but not required.
- Your company benefits include full medical and dental, a retirement plan, a company vehicle for work, and 15 vacation days a year.
- You must hire someone with at least a 2 year welding certificate that has some experience in pipeline welding. No exceptions.
- Your company has had trouble hiring people for evening and overnight shifts. The last three hires have left because they either get offered better hours or cannot balance the schedule with their family obligations.
- If you hire someone for \$16/hr or less, you CAN offer a SECOND person a job for \$16/hr or less, but the 2nd hire must have at least a one-year certificate. You also receive a \$5000 bonus for hiring two people for less than the price of one.

**Position** (what is your value? What do you have to offer? Or what might others have that you don't?):

---

**Interests** (what are your priorities and in what order do they matter?):

---

---

---

---

**Ideal Outcome** (what would you like to get and what does it look like?):

---

**BATNA** (if you can't get everything you want, what is a good backup?):

---

---



Workforce Solutions is an equal opportunity employer/program.  
 Auxiliary aids and services are available upon request to individuals with disabilities.  
 Relay Texas Numbers: 1-800-735-2989 (TDD) 1-800-735-2988 (voice) or 711

### Scenario #1: Pipeline Welder

#### Candidate #1

- You are an experienced pipeline welder of five years and have a one-year certificate from Lone Star College. You are looking to make no less than \$18/hr
- You are married with four children, ages 4, 7, 14, and 23 – good employer benefits are important to you.
- Your spouse works as a night nurse’s aide and so an evening shift is least desirable. You are looking for new work because your last company has asked you to work nights and it is difficult on your home life.
- You were fired from your first job after college for yelling at a co-worker. You have since not had any discipline or other write-ups at any of your jobs.

**Position** (what is your value? What do you have to offer? Or what might others have that you don’t?):

---

---

**Interests** (what are your priorities and in what order do they matter?):

---

---

---

---

**Ideal Outcome** (what would you like to get and what does it look like?):

---

---

**BATNA** (if you can’t get everything you want, what is a good backup?):

---

---



**Scenario #1: Pipeline Welder**

**Candidate #2**

- You are fresh out of college with a two-year certificate in pipeline welding. You have done an internship at PipeCo Inc. for four months and had good ratings from your mentor.
- You are a single parent of two children ages 9 and 11. Good employer benefits are important to you.
- Your family lives with your parents who take care of your children when you are working. You prefer not to work nights but can accommodate any schedule.
- Your previous work experience is as a pizza delivery driver, a retail sales clerk for a shoe store, and a night janitor for the school district.
- You do not know how much a welder with your experience should make and would be happy with anything over \$10/hr.

**Position** (what is your value? What do you have to offer? Or what might others have that you don't?):

---

**Interests** (what are your priorities and in what order do they matter?):

---

---

---

---

---

**Ideal Outcome** (what would you like to get and what does it look like?):

---

**BATNA** (if you can't get everything you want, what is a good backup?):

---

---



Workforce Solutions is an equal opportunity employer/program.  
 Auxiliary aids and services are available upon request to individuals with disabilities.  
 Relay Texas Numbers: 1-800-735-2989 (TDD) 1-800-735-2988 (voice) or 711

### Scenario #1: Pipeline Welder

#### Candidate #3

- You do not have a degree or certificate and learned your welding skills from your uncle. You feel you are fairly talented and can do some pipeline welds. You have worked in your uncle's shop for the past two years and have had zero customer complaints.
- You do not have children but have a serious girlfriend/boyfriend and s/he got you this interview because s/he works for the company in their business office.
- You would like to make at least \$12/hr. Benefits are not important to you but would be nice since they are required for all people and you would rather not pay out of pocket for a plan.
- You prefer to work nights or overnights but do not want to work on weekends.

**Position** (what is your value? What do you have to offer? Or what might others have that you don't?):

---

---

**Interests** (what are your priorities and in what order do they matter?):

---

---

---

---

**Ideal Outcome** (what would you like to get and what does it look like?):

---

---

**BATNA** (if you can't get everything you want, what is a good backup?):

---

---



### Scenario #1: Pipeline Welder

#### Candidate #4

- You have a two-year degree from Houston Community College in Pipeline Welding. You have two years of experience as a Pipeline Welding Tech for Shoreline Company and have just been promoted with a raise to Tech II making \$19/hr. You also get time and a half pay when you work nights and weekends, which you do not mind.
- You are looking for new work because you know the job market needs people like you. Because of this, you will settle for no less than \$23/hr.
- You have been offered a position with Sparx Inc. as a Tech II for \$22/hr.
- You have a spouse and a newborn daughter named Elizabeth. You would like to work closer to home and this company is right around the corner from your house. Your current job is a 30 mile drive round-trip and requires frequent travel. It is putting many miles on your vehicle which is starting to need more maintenance and repair work.
- You have great benefits at your current company with 18 vacation days and full medical and dental.

**Position** (what is your value? What do you have to offer? Or what might others have that you don't?):

---

---

**Interests** (what are your priorities and in what order do they matter?):

---

---

---

---

---

**Ideal Outcome** (what would you like to get and what does it look like?):

---

---

**BATNA** (if you can't get everything you want, what is a good backup?):

---

---



Workforce Solutions is an equal opportunity employer/program.  
Auxiliary aids and services are available upon request to individuals with disabilities.  
Relay Texas Numbers: 1-800-735-2989 (TDD) 1-800-735-2988 (voice) or 711